

ICMA Benchmarking Project FY 2005 Overview: Fleet Management

Jack Ireland

Equipment and Building Services



Fleet Management

- Comparison of fleet maintenance (total vs. equipment class)
 - Number of vehicles
 - Age of fleet
 - Maintenance cost per mile
 - Average cost of preventive maintenance per vehicle
 - Average cost of maintenance per vehicle
- Billable hours
- Percent of expenditures contracted
- Alternative fuel use
- Customer satisfaction



Total Vehicles & Heavy Equipment

	Number of Vehicles	Average Total Maintenance Cost per Vehicle
Dallas FY04 without Landfill & Fire/EMS	4,615	\$4,069
Dallas FY05 without Landfill & Fire/EMS	4,620	\$3,499

- FY04 report did not include Landfill equipment or Fire/EMS equipment
 - Above comparison based on same equipment classes for both FY04 and FY05
- 14% less cost per vehicle in FY05 – significant focus on lowering costs during FY05
 - During same period salary/pension cost increased



Total Vehicles & Heavy Equipment

	Number of Vehicles	Average Total Maintenance Cost per Vehicle
Dallas FY05	4,487	\$4,023
Dallas FY05 without Landfill, Fire/EMS, & light equipment	4,279	\$3,723
ICMA FY05	1,791	\$3,732

- McCommas Landfill Heavy Shop operated by Sanitation Services has 33 pieces of equipment with very high maintenance cost
 - Skews average cost per vehicle
- EBS cost (\$3,723) consistent with average
- All cities with lower costs have at least 60% fewer units (4,279 vs. 1,669)
 - More units typically means greater diversity
 - Tacoma, WA – population 196,000, 1,009 units, \$1,155 average cost
- Better analysis comes from equipment class rather than “totals”



Police Vehicles

(Marked Sedans, SUVs, Motorcycles)

	Number of Vehicles	Age (Months)	Cost per Mile	Average PM Cost per Vehicle	Average Total Maintenance Cost per Vehicle
Dallas FY05	797	34 (100,000 policy)	25¢	\$531	\$4,700 (125,000 policy)
ICMA FY05	286	41	25¢	\$1,075	\$3,620

- Dallas at average cost per mile - 25¢
 - Oklahoma City, San Antonio & Phoenix better
 - San Jose & Austin more costly
- Oklahoma City cost is 17¢ per mile – 80% of vehicles are take-home thus work only one shift per day; and replacement criteria has been 80,000 miles but is changing to 100,000 miles
- San Antonio cost is 18¢ per mile – they replace marked squads at 60,000 miles (24 month average age), PM at 3,000 miles instead of 5,000, & did not report Paint and Body
- In Sept 2005, Police Department’s PM compliance was 61% & now 77%



Light Vehicles I & II

(Automobiles, Vans, Pickups, SUVs)

	Number of Vehicles	Age in Months	Cost per Mile	Average PM Cost per Vehicle	Average Total Maintenance Cost per Vehicle
Dallas FY05	2129	69	17¢	\$136	\$1,422
ICMA FY05	848	68	18¢	\$374	\$1,386

- Dallas cost per mile, slightly better than average
 - Oklahoma City (9¢) & San Antonio (15¢) better
 - San Antonio did not report paint and body cost
 - Austin, Phoenix, & San Jose worse
- In Sept 2005, citywide PM compliance was 66% & now 88%; more PM cost expected in 2006



Solid Waste

(Automatic side-, front- and rear-loaders, Transfer Trailers, Roll-offs, Brush Trucks, and Rotobooms; Excludes Landfill)

	Number of Vehicles	Age in Months	Cost per Mile	Average PM Cost per Vehicle	Average Total Maintenance Cost per Vehicle
Dallas FY05	431	71	\$2.29	\$171	\$15,932
ICMA FY05	81	71	\$3.69	\$2,063	\$18,409

- In Sept 2005, Sanitation Services' PM compliance was 57% & now 90%; more PM cost expected in 2006
- Dallas cost per vehicle 13% better than average
 - San Antonio cost (\$13,805) better; they have 310 units but only 5 automated trucks (Dallas has 112 automated)
- In FY06 (Jan 2006), maintenance for 298 vehicles was privatized; rotobooms, transfer trucks/trailers, brush trucks/trailers, & rearloaders



Medium Duty Vehicles

(One-ton Service Trucks, Personnel Lifts)

	Number of Vehicles	Age in Months	Cost per Mile	Average PM Cost per Vehicle	Average Total Maintenance Cost per Vehicle
Dallas FY05	204	40	19¢	\$185	\$1,176
ICMA FY05	109	80	40¢	\$538	\$2,281

- Dallas cost per mile 53% better than ICMA
- Dallas 3rd best city with population over 100,000
- In Sept 2005, citywide PM compliance was 66% & now 88%; more PM cost expected in 2006



Heavy Duty Vehicles

(12-yr. Dump Trucks, Large Personnel Lifts, 3-ton Trucks)

	Number of Vehicles	Age in Months	Cost per Mile	Average PM Cost per Vehicle	Average Total Maintenance Cost per Vehicle
Dallas FY05	536	66	44¢	\$163	\$2,423
ICMA FY05	141	89	\$1.20	\$1,012	\$5,750

- Dallas cost per mile 63% better than ICMA
- Dallas 1st on list for cities with population over 100,000
- In Sept 2005, citywide PM compliance was 66% & now 88%; more PM cost expected in 2006



Heavy Equipment

(Construction Equipment, Gradalls, includes Landfill)

	Number of Vehicles	Age in Months	Hours per Year	Cost per Hour	Average PM Cost per Vehicle	Average Total Maintenance Cost per Vehicle
Dallas FY05	215	70	837	\$15.95	\$1,329	\$13,345
Dallas FY05 without Landfill	182	69	702	\$5.88	\$348	\$4,125
ICMA FY05	111	97	329	\$13.80	\$705	\$4,317

- Dallas is most costly City reporting when Landfill costs are included
- 4% better than average when landfill excluded



Hours Billed as a Percentage of Hours Available

	Hours Billed as a Percentage of Hours Available
Dallas FY04	77.2%
Dallas FY05	78.7%
ICMA FY05	69.6%

- Percent of 2,080 hours per mechanic that are charged to work orders
- Dallas better than average
- San Antonio reports 92.4% billable
 - They calculate off of 1,700 hours per mechanic (their goal)
 - Would be 75.5% if calculated off of 2,080 hours
- 21.3% indirect; examples include:
 - 10.3% vacation, sick, holiday & other leave
 - 6.5% training & supervision



Percent Contracted

	Percent of Fleet Expenditures Contracted
Dallas FY04	18.5%
Dallas FY05	20.8%
ICMA FY05	17.2%

- Services contracted include paint and body work, glass, transmissions, exhaust, component rebuild, upholstery, & differentials
- In FY06, percentage will be higher due to privatization pilot with Sanitation Heavy Equipment class
 - Additional 11% of fleet maintenance privatized through Serco contract (about 32% anticipated for FY06)
 - In February 2007, committee will be briefed on status of Serco contract (1/9/06 to 1/8/07)



Alternative Fuel Use

	Percent of vehicles and heavy equipment using alternative fuel	Percent of light vehicles (up to 10,000 GVW) using alternative fuel	Percent of heavy equipment using alternative fuel
Dallas FY04	30.7%	N/A	N/A
Dallas FY05	56.3%	60.3%	84.7%

- Biodiesel was added to ICMA alternative fuel list in FY05
 - All diesel equipment (except Landfill) used biodiesel during a portion of FY05



Alternative Fuel Use

	Percent of vehicles & heavy equipment using alternative fuel	Percent of light vehicles (up to 10,000 GVW) using alternative fuel	Percent of heavy equipment using alternative fuel
Dallas FY05	56.3%	60.3%	84.7%
ICMA FY05	15.7%	14.0%	38.3%

- Las Vegas only city reporting higher percent – 79.3% - includes reformulated gasoline which is considered alternative fuel by Nevada State Statute although ICMA does not recognize as alternative fuel
- Strategic plan for fleet and fuel to be developed



Customer Satisfaction

	Percent of customers/ respondents rating quality of service as:			
	Excellent	Good	Fair	Poor
Dallas FY05	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Dallas FY06 YTD	85%	13%	2%	0%
ICMA FY05	56.3%	32.2%	7.9%	3.6%

- Survey cards available to customers at the service desk at each maintenance facility
- Citywide internal customer survey planned



Summary of Proposed Actions

- Citywide internal customer survey to be completed
- Identify other opportunities to benchmark besides just ICMA – including private sector
- Strategic plan for fleet and fuel to be developed
- Request ICMA consortium or hold regional meeting of fleet managers to include Oklahoma City, Austin & San Antonio
- In February 2007, committee will be briefed on status of Serco contract (1/9/06 to 1/8/07)
- Equipment and Building Services selected as second department to undergo ISO 9001, Quality Management System – process currently underway

